

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA

UNITED FOOD AND COMMERCIAL ) No. 5:09-cv-01114-D  
WORKERS UNION, et al., Individually )  
and On Behalf of All Others Similarly )  
Situated, ) CLASS ACTION  
Plaintiffs, ) PLAINTIFF'S OPPOSITION TO  
vs. ) UNDERWRITER DEFENDANTS'  
CHESAPEAKE ENERGY ) MOTION TO DISMISS AMENDED  
CORPORATION, et al., ) COMPLAINT  
Defendants. )  
\_\_\_\_\_  
)

In addition to Chesapeake Energy Corporation (“Chesapeake”) and the Individual Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss, the Underwriter Defendants filed their own Motion With Brief in Support to Dismiss Amended Complaint (“Underwriter Defs.’ Mot.”) asserting that plaintiff has failed to allege that the Underwriter Defendants were “sellers” under §12(a)(2) of the Securities Act of 1933. Underwriter Defendants’ Underwriter Defs. Mot. at 2. This argument ignores the properly plead allegations of the Amended Complaint for Violation of the Federal Securities Laws (“Complaint”) and the Underwriter Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss should be denied.

As the Underwriter Defendants concede, the Supreme Court in *Pinter v. Dahl*, 486 U.S. 622 (1988), expands the definition of “seller” under §12(a)(2) to include a “person who successfully solicits the purchase, motivated at least in part by a desire to serve his own financial interests or those of the securities owner.” *Id.* at 647. Solicitation includes preparation and circulation of the prospectus as well as participation in roadshows to promote the offering. *Capri v. Murphy*, 856 F.2d 473, 478 (2d Cir. 1988) (finding that participation in preparation and circulation of prospectus sufficiently established seller status); *In re Am. Bank Note Holographics Sec Litig.*, 93 F. Supp. 2d 424, 439 (S.D.N.Y. 2000) (finding that participation in preparation of registration statement and prospectus and in roadshows sufficient to show solicitation); *In re OPUS360 Corp. Sec. Litig.*, No. 01Civ.2938(JGK)(JCF), 2002 WL 31190157, at \*10 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 2, 2002) (same).

The Underwriter Defendants were sellers under §12(a)(2) because they solicited purchases in the Offering. As alleged in the Complaint, the Underwriter Defendants merchandised Chesapeake stock by arranging multi-city roadshows in which they (along

with certain of the Individual Defendants) met with potential investors and presented highly favorable information about Chesapeake. ¶22.<sup>1</sup> Additionally, the Underwriter Defendants assisted in the planning of the Offering and engaged in “drafting sessions” in which they determined: (i) the strategy to best accomplish the Offering; (ii) the terms of the Offering, including the price at which Chesapeake stock would be sold; (iii) the language to be used in the Registration Statement (including the financial statements incorporated therein by reference); and (v) what responses would be made to the Securities and Exchange Commission in connection with its review of the Registration Statement. ¶¶23, 24. The Underwriter Defendants also drafted and disseminated the Offering documents and received fees of more than \$51 million collectively. ¶¶22, 25. These allegations are more than sufficient to allege seller status under §12(a)(2).<sup>2</sup>

The Underwriter Defendants rely on two cases that are inapplicable here. Underwriter Defs.’ Mem. at 2-3. In *In re Royal Ahold N.V. Sec. & ERISA Litig.*, 351 F. Supp. 2d 334 (D. Md. 2004), the court based its decision that the plaintiffs’ allegations were insufficient on their failure to provide factual support rather than conclusory statements. *Id.* at 406. As demonstrated above, this is not the case here as plaintiff has provided a number of factual

<sup>1</sup> Paragraph references (“¶\_” or “¶¶\_”) are to the Complaint.

<sup>2</sup> Whether a particular defendant engaged in sufficient solicitation to render itself liable under §12(a)(2) is ultimately a question of fact, and plaintiff need not plead solicitation with particularity as Fed. R. Civ. P. 9(b)’s specificity requirements do not apply. *In re Portal Software, Inc. Sec. Litig.*, No. C-03-5138 VRW, 2006 WL 2385250, at \*4 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 17, 2006); *Degulis v. LXR Biotechnology*, No. 95 Civ. 4204 (RWS), 1997 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 381, at \*17 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 21, 1997).

allegations to support the Underwriter Defendants' solicitation in the Offering. Also, in *In re Countrywide Fin. Corp. Sec. Litig.*, 588 F. Supp. 2d 1132 (C.D. Cal. 2008), there was no discussion regarding solicitation by the underwriters, as is alleged in this case. *Id.* at 1183. Moreover, courts have held that plaintiffs need not identify from which defendant they purchased shares in order to give underwriter defendants fair notice of the basis for the claims under Fed. R. Civ. P. 8. *See, e.g., In re WorldCom, Inc. Sec. Litig.*, 294 F. Supp. 2d 392, 423 (S.D.N.Y. 2003). The Complaint properly alleges that the Underwriter Defendants were "sellers" under §12(a)(2).

Accordingly, the Underwriter Defendants' Motion to Dismiss should be denied.

DATED: February 4, 2010

Respectfully submitted,

COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
JAMES I. JACONETTE  
FRANCIS A. DiGIACCO

---

s/ JAMES I. JACONETTE

JAMES I. JACONETTE

655 West Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Telephone: 619/231-1058  
619/231-7423 (fax)

COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
SAMUEL H. RUDMAN  
DAVID A. ROSENFELD  
58 South Service Road, Suite 200  
Melville, NY 11747  
Telephone: 631/367-7100  
631/367-1173 (fax)

COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
RANDI D. BANDMAN  
52 Duane Street, 7th Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
Telephone: 212/693-1058  
212/693-7423 (fax)

LYTLE, SOULÉ & CURLEE, P.C.  
MICHAEL C. FELTY  
MICHAEL A. BETTS  
119 North Robinson, Suite 1200  
Oklahoma City, OK 73102  
Telephone: 405/235-7471  
405/232-3852 (fax)

Lead Counsel for Plaintiffs

SCHWARZWALD McNAIR & FUSCO LLP  
EBEN O. McNAIR IV  
616 Penton Media Building  
1300 East Ninth Street  
Cleveland, OH 44114-1503  
Telephone: 216/566-1600  
216/566-1814 (fax)

Additional Counsel for Plaintiff

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on February 4, 2010, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the e-mail addresses denoted on the attached Electronic Mail Notice List, and I hereby certify that I have mailed the foregoing document or paper via the United States Postal Service to the non-CM/ECF participants indicated on the attached Manual Notice List.

I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct. Executed on February 4, 2010.

s/ JAMES I. JACONETTE  
\_\_\_\_\_  
JAMES I. JACONETTE

COUGHLIN STOIA GELLER  
RUDMAN & ROBBINS LLP  
655 West Broadway, Suite 1900  
San Diego, CA 92101-3301  
Telephone: 619/231-1058  
619/231-7423 (fax)  
E-mail: jamesj@csgrr.com

# Mailing Information for a Case 5:09-cv-01114-D

## Electronic Mail Notice List

The following are those who are currently on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case.

- **Hissan Ahsan Bajwa**  
hissanbajwa@paulhastings.com
- **Lily I Becker**  
lbecker@orrick.com,rrivera@orrick.com,gjohnson@orrick.com
- **Michael A Betts**  
betts@lytlesoule.com,mjones@lytlesoule.com
- **Francis A DiGiacco**  
fdigiacco@csgrr.com
- **Michael C Felty**  
felty@lytlesoule.com,weis@lytlesoule.com
- **E Joseph Giometti**  
jgiometti@orrick.com
- **Daniel Bruce Goldman**  
dangoldman@paulhastings.com
- **James I Jaconette**  
jamesj@csgrr.com,karenc@csgrr.com,e\_file\_sd@csgrr.com
- **David S Keenan**  
dkeenan@orrick.com
- **Drew Neville , Jr**  
dnevile@hartzoglaw.com,gbrown@hartzoglaw.com
- **Reagan Therese Roth**  
reaganroth@paulhastings.com
- **M Todd Scott**  
tscott@orrick.com,elee@orrick.com
- **Robert P Varian**  
rvarian@orrick.com,bclarke@orrick.com
- **James R Webb**  
jim.webb@mcafeetaft.com,karen.hill@mcafeetaft.com

- **Ryan S Wilson**  
RWilson@hartzoglaw.com,swatts@hartzoglaw.com

## Manual Notice List

The following is the list of attorneys who are **not** on the list to receive e-mail notices for this case (who therefore require manual noticing). You may wish to use your mouse to select and copy this list into your word processing program in order to create notices or labels for these recipients.

**Randi Dawn Bandman**

,

**Mary Katherine Blasy**

,

**Jack Gerald Fruchter**

,

**Christopher J Keller**

,

**Mark Peter Kindall**

,

**David Avi Rosenfeld**

,

**Samuel Howard Rudman**

,

**Barry G Sher**

,